

Paper Critique Guidelines

Structure of the Summary:

The report has two main components:

- Part 1: Determine ***one*** concept in the paper that you believe is a major contribution or limitation of the work and explain why it is important.
- Part 2: Discuss ***one*** new idea you had after reading the paper that builds on the work presented therein. Provide as much detail on this idea as possible, indicating why it is an interesting avenue for future work, how it can be done, etc. Structure of the report

Stay Focused (it's about Depth, not Breadth):

The report is limited to ***one page of text in 11pt font, single-spaced***¹. Your writing should be concise and coherent; focusing the discussion of these requirements will enable you to write a more complete report. Evaluation of these critiques will be based on your ability to express your thoughts and opinions clearly, concisely, and logically.

Do NOT:

- Briefly discuss three major contributions/limitations and ten new ideas: ONE contribution/limitation and ONE new idea per report. The objective is give detailed explanations for each part.
- Provide a summary or paper abstract; this is a critique meant to demonstrate your analysis, synthesis, and evaluation skills. It is not meant to demonstrate that you skimmed the paper and are capable of rote learning.

Submission Requirements:

Provide a ***hard copy*** of your report to me just ***before the lecture begins***. Reports submitted during or after class will not be accepted as I am trying to determine what you are capable of surmising from these works independently.

Origin:

This form of “reaction report” has been used with success in other courses at U of T. Specifically in ECE1718 by Professor Moshovos and Professor Kutulakos in CS2530. Professor Kutulakos has included online some examples of well written reports. Check out this [link](#).

¹ For your first submission only, I will allow you to submit a maximum of 1.5 pages without penalty. I'm looking for concise and coherently written arguments, so this flexibility is meant to help you, not lengthen your report (and thereby increase your work load). If you don't need it, don't use it =)